

Critical Appraisal of a Paper

This evaluation form should be used by the departmental scholar role tutor or nominee to evaluate the critical appraisal of a paper undertaken by the trainee.

Trainees are reminded of the College's Academic Integrity Policy which defines the identification, investigation, management and consequences of academic misconduct and plagiarism.

1 TRAINEE INFORMATION

ANZCA ID: Family name: _____
 First name: _____ Middle name: _____

2 EVALUATION DETAILS

Title of paper: _____

Date:

Was the paper selected in consultation with the departmental scholar role tutor? Yes No

3 EVALUATION

For guidance on the satisfactory completion of this activity, refer to the accompanying *Critical Appraisal of a Paper Guidelines* for departmental role scholar tutors and trainees.

Note: The type of paper selected will determine the relevancy of completing each of the headings below.

	Significant improvement required	Addressed, though some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	Not applicable
INTRODUCTION				
Research question				
Type of study				
RESEARCH METHODS				
Setting				
Randomisation and allocation of concealment				
Population				
Inclusion and exclusion criteria				
Measurements				
RESULTS				
Presentation of data				
Management of drop-outs/missing data				
Statistical analysis				

	Significant improvement required	Addressed, though some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	Not applicable
DISCUSSION				
Inferences from results				
Potential sources of error and bias				
Discussion of relevant literature				
Validity of conclusion				
CONCLUSION				
Overall quality of the study				
Clinical relevance				
Implications for own practice				

4 FEEDBACK AND REFLECTION

DEPARTMENTAL SCHOLAR ROLE TUTOR TO COMPLETE:

Examples of what was done well
Example: Your overall conclusion of the study included great insight to the clinical relevance for patients and your personal practice.

Areas that need improvement and action
Example: How the missing data was managed was not adequately explained.

TRAINEE TO COMPLETE:

Trainee reflection and comments
Example: I found the CONSORT checklist an invaluable tool to aid my critical appraisal and interpretation of the study.

Trainee action plan
Example: Next time I review a paper, I will pay particular attention to the statistical power of the study.

Trainees are not required to send this completed evaluation form to the College but must retain for any future reference.

5 NAMES AND SIGNATURES

Departmental scholar role tutor (or nominee) name: _____ Signature: _____

Trainee name: _____ Signature: _____