

# Scholar role activities - Critical appraisal of a paper evaluation

This evaluation form should be used by the departmental scholar role tutor or nominee to evaluate the critical appraisal of a paper undertaken by the trainee.

Trainees are reminded of the College's Academic Integrity Policy which defines the identification, investigation, management and consequences of academic misconduct and plagiarism.

## Personal details

College ID

First name

Surname

## Evaluation details

Title of Paper

Date

Was the paper selected in consultation with the departmental scholar role tutor? Yes No

For guidance on the satisfactory completion of this activity, refer to the accompanying guidelines.  
Please note: The type of paper selected will determine the relevancy of completing each of the headings below

	Significant improvement required	Some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	N/A
INTRODUCTION				
Research question				
Type of study				
RESEARCH METHODS				
Setting				
Randomisation and allocation of concealment				
Population				
Inclusion and exclusion criteria				
Measurements				



	Significant improvement required	Some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	N/A
RESULTS				
Presentation of data				
Management of drop-outs/missing data				
Statistical analysis				
DISCUSSION				
Inferences from results				
Potential sources of error and bias				
Discussion of relevant literature				
Validity of conclusion				
CONCLUSION				
Overall quality of the study				
Clinical relevance				
Implications for own practice				

## Feedback and reflection

To be completed by the departmental scholar role tutor

Examples of what was done well

*Example: Your overall conclusion of the study included great insight to the clinical relevance for patients and your personal practice.*

Areas that need improvement and action:

*Example: How the missing data was managed was not adequately explained.*



### Departmental Scholar Role Tutor (or Nominee) signature

Name \_\_\_\_\_

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

### To be completed by trainee

Trainee reflection and comments:

*Example: I found the CONSORT checklist an invaluable tool to aid my critical appraisal and interpretation of the study.*

Trainee action plan"

*Example: Next time I review a paper, I will pay particular attention to the statistical power of the study.*

### Trainee signature

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

This evaluation form should be uploaded to MyPortfolio.