



Scholar role activities - Critical appraisal of a topic evaluation

This evaluation form should be used by the departmental scholar role tutor or nominee to evaluate the critical appraisal of a topic undertaken by the trainee.

Trainees are reminded of the College’s Academic Integrity Policy which defines the identification, investigation, management and consequences of academic misconduct and plagiarism.

Personal details

College ID

First name

Surname

Evaluation details

Title of Topic

Date

Was the topic selected in consultation with the departmental scholar role tutor? Yes No

Is this evaluation contributing to evidence of completion for recognition of prior learning for an exemption for critical appraisal activities? Yes No

For guidance on the satisfactory completion of this activity, refer to the accompanying guidelines. Please note: The type of paper selected will determine the relevancy of completing each of the headings below:

	Significant improvement required	Some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	N/A
INTRODUCTION				
Defined question				
Elements of PICO (Patient, Intervention, Comparator, Outcome) addressed				
Rationale for choosing the topic				
METHODS – LITERATURE SEARCH				
Explicit inclusion/exclusion criteria				
Comprehensive search, including major electronic sources utilised				

	Significant improvement required	Some improvement required	Satisfactorily addressed	N/A
Key words/Medical subject heading terms stated				
Key studies selected for inclusion				
ANALYSIS OF THE EVIDENCE – INTERNAL VALIDITY (QUALITY OF THE STUDIES)				
Appraisal of included studies				
Appropriate checklist tool used				
Grading of studies				
Comments re: potential errors of studies				
Included papers and appropriateness for question				
Statistical analysis				
Analyses made on subgroups				
CONCLUSION				
Question answered by included studies				
Conclusion/ recommendation				
Clinical relevance				
Relevance of conclusion to local population				

Feedback and reflection

To be completed by the departmental scholar role tutor

<p>Examples of what was done well</p> <p><i>Example: You topic was well-focused by a specific and relevant question as you applied the PICO approach to build your topic question.</i></p>	
<p>Areas that need improvement and action:</p> <p><i>Example: Provide more detail on the explicit inclusion and exclusion criteria of your literature search.</i></p>	

Departmental Scholar Role Tutor (or Nominee) signature

Name _____

Signature _____ Date _____

To be completed by trainee

<p>Trainee reflection and comments:</p> <p><i>Example: When analysing the evidence, checklists such as PRISMA and STROBE provided significant guidance in assessing the validity and strength of study conclusions</i></p>	
<p>Trainee action plan”</p> <p><i>Example: Next time, I will ensure the evidence from the studies reviewed matches the recommendation from my assessment.</i></p>	

Trainee signature

Signature _____ Date _____

This evaluation form should be uploaded to the Training Portfolio System (TPS).